North Central State College

Aligning Policy Governance & Student Success while responding to a 100% performance-based higher education funding model

ACCT Concurrent Presentation October 15, 2015
Presentation Plan

1. College and location background
2. Carver Policy Governance ® Model
3. College Ends Policies
4. State performance funding model
5. College vision, mission, strategic plan, and goals
6. College student success goals and metrics
7. College performance on student success metrics
8. Remaining work on student success
North Central State College

- Located in north central Ohio
- Serves the three-county district of Ashland, Crawford & Richland
- Population ~ 220,000
## Major Area Employers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>2015 Jobs</th>
<th>Pct Regional Jobs</th>
<th>Average Wages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>16,615</td>
<td>18%</td>
<td>$45,405</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Care &amp; Social Assistance</td>
<td>13,148</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>$35,293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government</td>
<td>12,320</td>
<td>13%</td>
<td>$39,664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retail Trade</td>
<td>10,459</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>$23,944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accomodation &amp; Food Services</td>
<td>7,247</td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>$12,882</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Administration/Support Services</td>
<td>5,377</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>$21,199</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
College Data

1. Budget: $19 million
2. Total annual head count: ~3,750
3. Full Time Equivalent: 1,934
4. Division Enrollment: BIT 904; EPS 462; Health 1,320; Liberal Arts 1048
5. Adult > 25: 64%
6. Full-time: 25%
7. Female: 61%
8. Minority: 10%
The Carver Policy Governance ® Model

- Created by Dr. John Carver
- Designed to empower boards to fulfill their obligation of accountability for the organizations they govern.
- The model enables the board to focus on the larger issues
  - To Delegate with clarity
  - To Control without meddling
  - To rigorously Evaluate the accomplishment of the organization
  - To truly Lead the organization!
The Carver Policy Governance ® Model

Carver Policy Principles

1. **Ownership** (board as servant to shareholders who morally and legally own the organization)

2. **Governance position** (owners above and operation below)

3. **Board holism** (authority only as a group)

4. **Ends policies** (reflect purpose based on what good, for whom, at what cost)

5. **Means policies** (everything that is not Ends)
The Carver Policy Governance ® Model

Carver Policy Principles (continued)

5. **Executive limitations** (to avoid prescribing means)

6. **Policy sizes** (starting at the broadest and most inclusive; then narrowing one level at a time)

7. **Delegation to management**: CEO has sole accountability

8. **Reasonable interpretation**: to any policy not stated (as long as it is not Illegal, Unethical, or Imprudent)

9. **Monitoring**: Evaluation of CEO based on Ends and Executive Limitations
The Carver Policy Governance ® Model

What Policy Governance is NOT!

• It is not a specific board structure. It does not dictate board size, specific officers, or require a CEO.

• While it gives rise to principles for committees, it does not prohibit committees nor require specific committees.

• It is not a set of individual “best practices” or tips for piecemeal improvement.

• It does not dictate what a board should do or say about group dynamics, needs assessment, basic problem solving, fund raising, managing change...
It provides a framework to ensure accountability of the Board and of the President
Policy Governance® Cycle

Board’s Domain

- Board Judges Acceptability of Performance
- Board Establishes Ends and Executive Limitations Policies

Management’s Domain

- Submission of Monitoring Reports
- CEO’s Interpretations
- Strategic Planning Update
- Directing, Supervising, Controlling
- Sub-CEO Delegation

Board’s Domain
About the Board

Appointed by the Local BOE = 6
Appointed by the Governor = 3
Total seats on the BOT = 9

Current Board Composition
Ashland County = (2) Locally Appointed, (1) Governor Appointed
Crawford County = (2) Locally Appointed, (1) Governor Appointed
Richland County = (2) Locally Appointed, (1) Governor Appointed
Board Ends Policies

1. Equal opportunity/diversity
2. Job readiness
3. High demand / emerging technologies
4. Career development
5. Transferability
6. Enrichment
Ohio’s Performance Based Funding
Ohio SSI Community College Formula History, 2009-2015

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FY 2009-2013</th>
<th>FY 2014</th>
<th>FY 2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Primarily enrollment-based with inclusion of success points (5% to 10%)&lt;br&gt;Stop Loss (99%-96%)</td>
<td>50% enrollment + 25% course completion + 25% success points&lt;br&gt;97% stop loss</td>
<td>Elimination of enrollment component&lt;br&gt;Combination of course completion (50%), success points (25%) &amp; completion metrics (25%)&lt;br&gt;At-risk or access category application&lt;br&gt;No stop loss</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
FY 2015 Framework Summary

- Cost-Based Course Completions* 50%
- Success Points 25%
- Cost-Based Completion Milestones* 25%

*Access Categories Applied
- Adult (age 25 and over at time of enrollment)
- Low-Income, Pell Eligible (ever in college career)
- Minority (African American, Hispanic, Native American)

All data averaged over three years
Component 1: Course Completion (50%)

Cost-Based Calculation

- Average statewide cost based on level of course and subject area (aggregation of CIP codes)
- # of FTE who pass course * determined cost

Access category weight:

15% for any student with one (or more) risk factors
Component 2: Success Points (25%)

Developmental Education Success

• # of Students completing developmental education Math and enrolling in first college-level math course (1 point)
• # of Students completing developmental education English & enrolling in first college-level English course (1 point)

12 Credit Hours

• # of students earning first 12 college-level credits (1 point)

24 Credit Hours

• # of students earning first 24 college-level credits (1 point)

36 Credit Hours

• # of students earning first 36 college-level credits (1 point)
Component 3: Completion Milestones (25%)

- Associate Degree Completions
- Certificate Completions
- Transfer w/12+ credit hours

Cost-Based Model

Access Category Weights:
- 25% for one access category
- 66% for two access categories
- 150% for three access categories
Post FY 2015

OACC Recommendations for FY 2016-17:

1. Less than 30+ credit hour certificates & Certificates-of-value
   - To minimize variation and inconsistency across institutions, continue to establish common definitions and data collection processes for short-term certificates (less than 1-year).
   - **Data**
     - Do not include short-term certificates within the allocation model in FY 2016-2017.
   - Certificates-of-value need further definition from the Ohio Board of Regents

2. Data consistency and reliability (e.g., use of projected data)
   - Course completions:
     - Continue to use most recent three-year average.
Vision

North Central State College is the leader in affordable quality higher education with programs leading to employment and/or academic transfer and a beacon for achieving greater community prosperity and better quality of life.
Mission

North Central State College exists for the citizens of its service region to attain the knowledge and skills to succeed in their chosen path of learning, work or enrichment, sufficient for the college to justify available resources.
Strategic Plan

The strategic plan is the pathway for the achievement of the college’s mission of access and success through the alignment of the human, fiscal and physical resources.
Strategic Goals

1. Access
2. Success
3. Resources
Strategic Goal: Access

1. Foster a student-welcoming and community-collaborative culture (welcoming environment; partnerships)

2. Provide affordable and viable learning (in emerging technologies, and transfer)

3. Offer effective outreach and delivery (online, satellite, cohort, block scheduling)
Strategic Goal: Success

1. Foster student goal formation and completion (state factors; course, term, year, degree; transfer; certificates; licensures-pass rates; internships)

2. Uphold a student-centered learning environment (in/out the classroom; early alert; support services; intrusive advising)

3. Maintain a culture of excellence (quality, assessment, data-analytics, accreditations)
Strategic Goal: Resources

1. Be a great place to work (valuing people, integrity, communication, civility, shared governance, accountability, diversity)

2. Increase fiscal resources and accountability (revenues, enrollment, fundraising, grants, efficiencies, balanced budget, reserve)

3. Optimize college assets (facilities, technology, equipment)
Metrics of Student Success
Alignment of Success Metrics
With Ohio Board of Regents
1. Moving from a development course to another
2. Moving from a developmental to a college level course
3. Course completion
4. Finishing 12, 24, and 36 credit hours
5. Transferring
6. Graduating
Performance Funding Alignment at NCSC

25% of funding for FY 2015 is based on students hitting completion milestones. A number of strategies have been adopted to improve this area:

1. New students are now required to meet with an advisor to complete an academic plan.
2. Faculty were provided course completion % by course section.
3. Pathways were created to help high school students complete a minimum of 12 credit hours before transferring to a 4 year institution.
Performance Funding Alignment

25% of funding for FY 2015 is based upon Student Success Points

4. Redesigned English and Math DEVED Curriculum to accelerate students into college level coursework.
   a. Introduced embedded tutoring and co-requisite labs
   b. Introduced courses similar to Statway and Quantway

50% of funding for FY 2015 is based upon course completion

5. Implemented new policies to incent students to complete courses
   a. Early alerts on attendance and progress in the semester
   b. Midterm grades
   c. Piloted a faculty/advisor sign off for students wishing to withdraw from a class
   d. Two student loan disbursements

6. Developed student course success and retention metrics to engage faculty in completion efforts and encourage data driven decisions
Institutional Success Metrics

1. Successfully complete developmental instruction and advance to credit-bearing (2012-14 AtD cohorts referred to discipline).
   a) Cohort (2012-14) completion of math sequence per year was 35%, 25% and 43% consecutively.

2. Enroll in and successfully complete initial college-level gateway courses such as English and math (2011-13 AtD entire cohorts).
   a) Cohort completion of gateway math within two years was 20%, 27% and 31% consecutively.
Institutional Success Metrics

3. Successfully complete higher number of college-level credits (no developmental) (per AtD cohort 2012-2-14).
   a) completing 12 credits within a year was 46%, 39% and 42%
   b) completing 24 credits within a year was 16%, 13% and 13%
   c) completing 36 credits within two years was 16%, 19% and 14%

4. Persist (re-enroll or graduate) from term-to-term and year-to-year (2012-14 AtD cohorts).
   a) Cohort term-to-term was 69%, 68% and 68%.
   b) Fall-to-fall was 47%, 44% and 49% consecutively.

5. Attain a credential: Cohort (2009-2012) graduation rates within four years were 16.7%, 15.3%, and 17.5% consecutively.
6. Dual enrollment

a) In fall 2012, 52% of matriculating seniors placed in developmental courses, and few of them (12%) had early college experience.
b) In 2014, the college piloted a program requiring only college-readiness for classes with math/writing pre-requisites.
c) The college further increased access by waiving tuition (2014-15).
d) In response to a new state law mandating expanded access to early college classes but also requiring minimum tuition, the college continued to bring its program to scale in 2015-16 by waiving cost of books.
e) As a result, the number of early college students increased from 460 in 2012-13 to 822 in 2014-15, and 876 for fall 2015.
f) More importantly, more students are now matriculating to NCSC with early college experience and who are college ready.
g) Developmental placement rates of matriculating seniors dropped to 44% in 2014-15 (from 52% in 2012).
h) For the last two years (including fall 2015), nearly a quarter of matriculating seniors have enrolled in the college with early college experience.
7. Degree attainment

1. The college has taken on multiple initiatives to expedite degree attainment
2. Guaranteeing to not increase tuition for four years for students who attend full time (at least 12 credit hours), succeed in their classes, and persist in consecutive semesters
3. Reducing hours required to attain degree (from a maximum of 72 credits to a maximum of 65 credits)
4. Improving support services including extensive advising with an academic liaison between student services and academic services in every division
5. Opening up more pathways for dual enrollment high school students to earn college credit
6. Developing and posting online sample "academic pathways" specifically for early college/dual-enrollment students with courses guaranteed to transfer
7. Advising to maximize degree attainment prior to semester conversion in fall 2012 leading to highest number of annual graduates (488 degrees and certificates)
NCSC extensively uses labor market information and wage data with Economic Modeling Specialists, Inc. (EMSI) software.

a) Curriculum and program review with labor market metrics including: total jobs, net job growth, local wages, openings, etc.

b) Used this data for a complete redesign of engineering technology programs, with a strong focus on 1-year certificates in industrial technology.

c) Used data to determine program elimination, such as discontinuance of massage therapy program and financial management programs.

d) Used data to reconfigure the paralegal program for alternate delivery.

e) Used data to reconfigure early childhood education program based on compensation of graduates.

f) The college is collaborating with the Ohio Department of Jobs and Family Services (ODJFS) to receive wages data for post-graduation evaluation.
Institutional Success Metrics

Labor market information and wage data with Economic Modeling Specialists, Inc. (continued)

g) **Counseling/advising.** NCSC provides on its website a "career toolkit" of free tools to assist potential and newer students in career guidance. This includes: Focus2 assessment software to match interests to jobs/programs, the Career Coach tool that repackages EMSI's data in a user-friendly manner, and College Central Network allowing students to view local postings and access a variety of career-related supports.

h) **Meta majors.** All new applicants unsure of a specific major must now select a broader "meta-major," and choose a specific program within a semester or two. All incoming students use these tools in career exploration assignments for their required First-Year Experience course. The college has connected recently to Ohio Means Jobs’ website that links students to jobs across the state.
Institutional Success Metrics

Federal/State Grants & Technical Assistance from various Foundations:

1. **TRIO** (learning community of low-income, first generation, disabled)
2. **ATD** (tutoring: collaboration with JFS, embedded)
3. **DEI** (co-requisite labs for near cut-off placement scores)
4. **CCA/GPS** (Meta Majors, Co-requisites vs. Prerequisites)
5. **Title III** (intrusive advising, academic liaisons, software)
6. **Ohio Student Success Center** (best practices, online tutoring)
7. **Completion by Design** (connection, entry, progression, completion)
8. **Ohio Math Initiative** (statway/quantway)
Institutional Success Metrics in alignment with strategic plan - Summary

a. Maintained good fall-to-spring retention rates for all first time students at 68%.
b. Increased all student credit completion to 76%; credits completed by minority increased by 5%
c. Increased course success rate: all to 84%; online to 79%; satellite to 85%; early college to 97%, and cohort to 95%
d. Twenty one of 33 programs improving their course success rate
e. Student with apprenticeship / Workforce Partnerships increased from 150 to 223
f. Excellent licensure / certification rates with the average rate being 97%
Institutional Success Metrics in alignment with strategic plan

Goal 1: Foster student goal completion (examples)

- Completion number of graduates and certificates, average over past 3 years: 368 (although percentages are high, numbers are in single or double digits)
  - Increasing: Occupational Therapy (75%), General Studies AS (50%), Management/Business (36%), Mechanical Engineering (30%), Nursing (29%), Respiratory Therapy (15%).
  - Decreasing: General Studies (77%), Technical Studies (63%), Paralegal (57%), Police Academy (50%), Early Childhood (50%), Engineering Design (44%)
- Percent spring associate degree graduates transferring to a university within a year, average 2012-2014: 20% (no change)
- Programs with highest transfer rate: Engineering (67%), General Studies (59%), Human Services (54%), Management (32%), Early Childhood (32%)
Institutional Success Metrics in alignment with strategic plan

Goal 2: Uphold a student-centered learning environment (Annual 2013 to 2015) (examples):

- Course success (ABCDP) by OBR demographics access factors
  - All students success: 84% (increased 3%)
  - Minority success: 73% (increased 3%)
  - Age 25 and older success: 84% (increased 2%)
  - Pell eligible success: 80% (increased 2%)
  - Developmental math as access category: 79% (increased 2%)
  - Overall course success if one access category: 81% (increased 2%)
  - Overall course success if two access categories: 79% (increased 2%)
  - Overall course success if three access categories: 80% (increased 1%)

- Fall credits completed by incoming non-high school freshmen cohort (Fall 2012 to Fall 2014):
  - All students credit completion 76% (increased 2%)
  - Minority: credits completed 65% (increased 10%)
  - Age 25 and older: credits completed 79% (increased 4%)
  - Pell eligible: credits completed 72% (increased 1%)
  - Developmental math: credits completed 69% (increased 2%)
Institutional Success Metrics in alignment with strategic plan

Goal 3: Maintain a culture of excellence (examples)

- Top quarterly wages post graduation: Engineering/Manufacturing & Healthcare ($9k-$10k)
- Graduate industry of employment: health care & social assistance, manufacturing, retail trade, administrative & support services, educational services, government, accommodation & food, …
- Licensure/certification as percent of graduates:
  - Nursing 91%
  - LPN: 99%
  - PTA: 92%
  - OTA: 100%
  - Radiological science: 100%
  - Respiratory care: 98%
  - Criminal justice: 100%
  - Early childhood: 60% (No ECE graduates took the licensure test last year)
Continuing Work on Student Success
Strategic Planning Long Term Goals, 2016-2018

1. **Access:** Increase headcount and credit FTE enrollment by at least 1% over the previous year.

2. **Success:** Increase the average of credit completion, course completion, term-to-term persistence, fall-to-fall retention, transfer, and the graduation rate (including certificates) by at least 2% over the previous year.

3. **Resources:** Increase the sum of revenues from tuition, grants, and fund raising, as well as the reserve, by at least 3% over the previous year.

4. **Excellence:** Continually improve quality and stakeholders’ satisfaction as partly measured by the survey of students, employees, employers, and other stakeholders.
Remaining Work on Student Success

1. Increase proactive contact with students, online and face-to-face (high tech and high touch)
2. Develop earlier interventions especially for at-risk students
3. Increase year-to-year retention
4. Improve graduation rate
5. Increase career counseling
6. Involve the faculty fully in the college’s cultural, structural, and system changes
7. Continue enhancing transfer articulation agreements and reverse transfer tracking
8. Use employer advisory committee feedback to enhance students’ soft skills
9. Implement a cohort program with Competency Based Education especially for adult learners
10. Enhance tracking of students through employment to improve college processes
11. Take our successes to scale by sharing them
Inaugural CollegeNOW Bioscience Graduating Class – Biggest Outcome Example
Policy Governance at North Central State College Means…
From Access to Success…
It is all about the students